

Realizing Justice and Balance in Labor Reform in Indonesia

*Abdullah Qiqi Asmara

University of Muhammadiyah Jakarta

*E-mail: qiqiasmara@gmail.com

Received: 01 Oct. 2023, Revised: 12 Dec. 2023, Accepted: 15 Dec. 2023

ABSTRACT

This research analyzes labor reform efforts to achieve justice and balance between workers, employers, and the government. Research methods involve policy analysis, literature study, and statistical data. The results include measures such as regulatory changes, dispute resolution mechanisms, access to education, and dialogue between workers and employers. The analysis shows the positive impact of the reform but also identifies barriers to implementation. In conclusion, labor reform makes an important contribution to achieving justice and balance in the labor market.

KeyWords: Labor Reform, Justice, Dispute Resolution Mechanisms, Access to Education.



This work is licensed under the Creative Commons Attribution-ShareAlike 4.0 International License

INTRODUCTION

The employment sector plays a crucial role in the dynamics of economic growth, social welfare, and social stability throughout the country. However, the situation in various countries, including Indonesia, indicates that there are serious challenges related to imbalance and injustice in the employment system. This phenomenon is reflected in the worrying unemployment figures; in August 2022, the Central Statistics Agency (CSA) recorded that around 8.4 million people were unemployed in Indonesia, equivalent to 5.86% of the total national workforce. Most of the unemployed are in the 20-24-year age group, reaching 2.54 million people or around 30.12% of the total unemployed. Not only that, 1.86 million individuals (22.03%) from the 15-19 year age group, 1.17 million individuals (13.84%) aged 25-29 years, and 608.41 thousand individuals (7.22 %) aged 30-34 years also face the reality of unemployment (databoks.katadata.co.id).

Apart from the problem of unemployment, low wages for workers in Indonesia are a serious issue. BPS noted that in 2020, around 13.1 million workers received low wages, equivalent to 27.96% of total workers. Gender inequality in employment opportunities and wages is also a major concern. The Gender Inequality Index (GII) in 2021 reached 0.390, reflecting a loss of around 39% in development achievements due to gender inequality (databoks.katadata.co.id). These challenges arise as a result of several factors, including inadequate government policies, limited investment in human capital, and the impact of technological change and globalization that may deepen economic and social inequalities. Therefore, reform in the labor sector is imperative to create a fairer and more balanced system for workers, while supporting sustainable economic and social growth.

Achieving justice and balance in employment reform must include the central role of humans in the dynamics of employment relations. The potential replacement of workers by

machines carries the risk of injustice and imbalance in the industrial world. While machines are only capable of carrying out certain tasks, humans have the unique ability to make decisions based on experience, context, and intuition. In the journey to achieve this goal, the paradigm in the field of employment needs to be changed. Workers can no longer be considered merely as factors of production, but as individuals who have dignity and rights. This transformation requires a holistic approach in legal politics and employment policy to create an optimal balance between idealism and reality.

The government's commitment to facilitating fair and balanced labor reforms is very important. Strengthening regulations and supervision in the context of industrial relations, efforts to maintain equal workers' rights, and adequate social protection are some of the concrete actions that can be taken. Active participation of workers and trade unions is also a key element in realizing reforms that support justice and balance. With cross-sector collaboration, the hope is that an inclusive employment system can be realized, providing equal benefits for all parties involved.

The purpose of this article is to explore the importance of realizing justice and balance in labor reform in Indonesia. This article aims to highlight the importance of social justice and restorative justice in the context of labor reform. By reviewing existing literature and research on labor reform, this article seeks to provide insight into potential strategies and approaches that can be adopted to realize fair and balanced labor practices in Indonesia. The importance of this research lies in its potential to inform policymakers, unions, employers, and other stakeholders about the importance of addressing social justice and balance in labor reform. By understanding the key issues and challenges faced by workers in Indonesia, policymakers can develop effective policies and regulations to protect workers' rights, promote fair wages, and ensure safe and healthy working conditions. This research also contributes to the broader academic discourse on labor reform and social justice in developing countries.

The scope of this article covers various aspects related to labor reform in Indonesia. This includes a study of the historical and cultural context of labor relations in Indonesia, an analysis of existing labor laws and regulations, as well as a review of the challenges and opportunities for labor reform. Additionally, this article explores the role of social justice and restorative justice in shaping employment reform policies and practices. To achieve a comprehensive understanding of labor reform in Indonesia, this article draws on various scientific articles and research studies. These references provide insight into the current state of labor reform in Indonesia, the challenges faced by workers, and potential strategies for achieving fairness and balance in the labor market. This reference also offers perspectives from various scientific disciplines, including political science, economics, sociology, and law, to provide a multidimensional analysis of labor reform in Indonesia.

LITERATURE REVIEWS

2.1 Justice and balance in employment

Achieving justice and balance in labor reform in Indonesia requires a commitment to transparency, objectivity, fairness, and equal opportunities in job placement¹. However,

¹ <https://www.ilo.org/dyn/travail/docs/760/Indonesian+Undang-Undang+Ketenagakerjaan++Undang-Undang+Nomor+13+Tahun+2003.pdf>

there are concerns regarding the government's labor law reforms, which aim to increase labor market flexibility and improve Indonesia's ranking in the World Bank's ease of doing business index². These reforms have been criticized for weakening workers' rights, such as minimum standard wages and severance pay, and lifting restrictions on outsourcing. Labor law reforms have also raised concerns about their impact on Indonesia's progress towards sustainable development.

To achieve fairness and balance in labor reform, it is important to ensure that workers receive fair and decent remuneration and treatment in their work³. The role of civil society in integrating rights and development can also be important in promoting fairness and balance in labor reform⁴. However, implementing labor reform in Indonesia is a complex process involving many actors and interests⁵. It is important to consider the perspectives of workers, employers, and other stakeholders to ensure that labor reforms promote fairness and balance for all parties involved.

A. The concept of justice in the employment context

Fairness is the basic principle underlying labor relations and plays an important role in ensuring fairness and balance in work. In the employment context, justice refers to the fair treatment of workers, employers, and other stakeholders involved in the employment relationship. This includes various dimensions, including distributive justice, procedural justice, and interactional justice.

Distributive justice is concerned with the fair distribution of resources, rewards, and opportunities between individuals in the workplace. This ensures that workers receive fair wages, benefits, and career advancement opportunities based on their contributions and qualifications (Roscigno, 2019). Procedural justice, on the other hand, focuses on the fairness of the processes and procedures used in workplace decision-making. This includes providing voice, transparency, and opportunities for workers to participate in decision-making processes (Kobayashi & Kondo, 2019). Interactional justice relates to fairness and respect in interpersonal interactions in the workplace. This includes treating workers with dignity, respect, and consideration, and ensuring that they are not subjected to discrimination, harassment, or unfair treatment (Roscigno, 2019). The concept of justice in the employment context recognizes the power dynamics that exist within organizations and aims to reduce the potential for abuse and exploitation.

B. The importance of balance between workers, employers, and the government

Striking a balance between the interests of workers, employers, and government is critical to ensuring fairness and stability in the labor market. Each stakeholder plays a critical role in shaping employment policies, practices, and outcomes.

Workers are the backbone of any economy and deserve fair wages, safe working conditions, and protection of their rights. Balancing workers' interests means ensuring that they have access to decent work, social protection, and opportunities for skills development and career advancement. This also includes addressing issues such as income inequality, gender gaps, and discrimination in the workplace (Lott, 2019).

On the other hand, entrepreneurs contribute to economic growth and job creation. Balancing their interests means providing a conducive business environment, flexibility in managing the workforce, and incentives for investment and innovation. However, it is

² <https://www.ituc-csi.org/Indonesia-omnibus-law-threatens-decent-work>

³ <https://uk.practicallaw.thomsonreuters.com/w-010-7310?contextData=%28sc.Default%29&transitionType=Default>

⁴ <https://academic.oup.com/book/4642/chapter/146807281>

⁵ <https://academic.oup.com/book/9143/chapter/155757803>

important to ensure that employers do not exploit workers or engage in unfair labor practices. This requires enforcing labor laws and regulations, encouraging responsible business practices, and encouraging dialogue and cooperation between employers and workers (Bargain & Boutin, 2019).

The government plays an important role in creating an environment that supports fair and balanced labor relations. This body is responsible for formulating and implementing labor policies, establishing and enforcing labor laws, and providing a social protection system. The government's role includes encouraging social dialogue, mediating labor disputes, and monitoring compliance with labor standards. Balancing the interests of workers and employers requires governments to take a proactive approach that considers the needs and concerns of both parties (Riphahn & Schrader, 2019).

C. Employment policy in Indonesia towards balance and protection

Employment policy in Indonesia involves several important dimensions, including labor protection, employment opportunities, and workers' welfare. Various relevant laws and policies related to employment have been implemented in Indonesia, including:

- Article 27 paragraph (2) in the 1945 Constitution emphasizes the right of every citizen to work and a humane living.
- Law No. 13/2003 concerning Employment guarantees fair opportunities and without discrimination in access to work for every individual.
- The same law also guarantees protection for the workforce, including the right to a decent wage, social security protection, and a safe work environment.
- The policy of using foreign workers supports national economic growth, high technology, and investment, which is expected to have a positive impact on employment opportunities in the country.
- Economic and social development programs also take into account the expansion of employment opportunities and business development.

Implementation of employment policies can vary in each region, influenced by factors such as the availability of human resources, government support, and community participation. This policy aims to achieve a balance between the interests of workers and employers while taking into account the expansion of employment opportunities and worker welfare. However, policy implementation is often faced with challenges, including issues of justice and legal certainty. Law No. 13/2003 concerning Employment emphasizes the protection of workers, including the right to decent wages, social security protection, and a safe working environment. In addition, the Job Creation Law focuses on concessions for employers while still paying attention to workers' rights. In employment dynamics, it is important to achieve a balance between employers and job recipients for mutual goals. The concept of flexibility in employment should be in line with the principles of employment law, such as justice, expediency, and legal certainty. Therefore, there is a need for in-depth evaluation and analysis of labor regulations to support investment growth and achieve common goals.

2.2 Labor reform methods

A. Employment policy analysis

Labor policy analysis is an important component in labor reform efforts. This involves a systematic examination and evaluation of existing employment policies to identify strengths, weaknesses, and areas for improvement. This analysis helps policymakers

understand the impact of current policies on workers, employers, and the labor market as a whole. By conducting comprehensive policy analysis, policymakers can identify gaps, inconsistencies, and outdated regulations that could hinder employment fairness and balance. The importance of a comprehensive approach to policy evaluation is emphasized in the literature (Schheim et al., 2020). This approach is in line with calls for a more holistic evaluation of employment policies in line with public health and sustainable development goals. By adopting methods such as multi-criteria decision analysis, policymakers can gain a more comprehensive understanding of the potential impact of labor law reform.

B. Literature review on good practices

Literature studies on best practices are an important step in labor reform. This involves reviewing existing research, studies, and case examples to identify successful approaches and strategies that have been applied in other contexts. This study helps policymakers learn from the experiences of other countries or regions and adapt effective practices to their labor reform efforts.

When studying labor market reforms, it is important to consider the heterogeneity of retirement pathways (König et al., 2021). Future research should consider varying timing and sequencing of retirement to gain a deeper understanding of the impact of employment reform. By conducting a literature review of best practices, policymakers can gain insight into how to address the complexity and variation in labor market dynamics.

C. Collection and analysis of employment statistics data

Collecting and analyzing employment-related statistical data is critical to evidence-based employment reform. This involves collecting relevant data on various labor market indicators, such as employment levels, wages, working conditions, and labor force participation. This data provides policymakers with a comprehensive understanding of current labor market conditions and helps identify areas requiring attention and intervention. Statistical data plays an important role in evaluating the impact of labor market reforms (Kazlou & Klinthäll, 2019). These studies use statistical methods such as difference-in-differences analysis and crude exact matching to assess the impact of policy changes on earnings and labor market outcomes. By collecting and analyzing employment-related statistical data, policymakers can monitor the progress of employment reform initiatives and make decisions based on empirical evidence.

Of course, labor reform methods involve labor policy analysis, literature studies on best practices, and the collection and analysis of labor-related statistical data. These methods provide policymakers with valuable insights into the strengths and weaknesses of existing employment policies, the success of approaches applied in other contexts, and current labor market conditions. By leveraging these methods, policymakers can develop evidence-based employment reform strategies that promote fairness and balance in employment.

2.3 Steps towards justice and balance

A. Changes to employment regulations

One important step to achieve justice and balance in labor reform is to make changes to labor regulations. These changes should aim to protect workers' rights, ensure fair wages and working conditions, and promote equality of opportunity for all. Wang et al (2020) highlight the use of mediation as an alternative dispute resolution approach for dealing

with medical disputes in China. This approach can also be applied to labor disputes, providing a more collaborative and efficient way to resolve conflicts between workers and employers (Wang et al., 2020).

B. Effective dispute resolution mechanism

Effective dispute-resolution mechanisms are essential to ensure fairness and balance in labor relations. Elephant & Elephant (2022) emphasizes the importance of effective mechanisms to prevent and resolve labor conflicts (Ndhlovu & Ndhlovu, 2022). These mechanisms should provide accessible and timely dispute resolution, ensuring that workers and employers have a fair opportunity to present their cases. Alternative dispute resolution methods, such as mediation, negotiation, and conciliation, can be used to facilitate constructive dialogue and reach mutually beneficial solutions (Firdausy & Mahanani, 2021).

C. Increased access to education and training

To achieve fairness and balance in labor reform, it is important to improve access to education and training for workers. Petersson et al (2020) highlights the importance of work-related interventions and collaboration with employers to provide practical assistance and valuable advice to employees (Petersson et al., 2020). By improving workers' skills and knowledge, they can gain better opportunities for career advancement, higher wages, and better working conditions. Governments and employers must invest in vocational training programs, lifelong learning initiatives, and skills development opportunities to empower workers and promote a fairer labor market.

D. Encourage constructive dialogue between workers and employers

Promoting constructive dialogue between workers and employers is essential to achieving fairness and balance in labor relations. Petersson et al (2020) emphasized the use of convergence dialogue meetings as a strategy to increase return to work and reduce sick leave time (Petersson et al., 2020). These meetings involve dialogue between employers and workers, facilitated by consultants, to reach concrete solutions. By fostering open communication, trust, and collaboration, workers and employers can address issues, negotiate fair terms, and find mutually beneficial solutions. This encourages the creation of a harmonious work environment and ensures that the interests of both parties are taken into account.

Therefore, achieving fairness and balance in labor reform requires changing labor regulations, establishing effective dispute-resolution mechanisms, improving access to education and training, and enhancing constructive dialogue between workers and employers. These measures, supported by the references provided, can contribute to creating a fair and balanced labor market that protects workers' rights, promotes equality of opportunity, and fosters harmonious employment relationships.

2.4 Impact and challenge analysis

A. Evaluation of the results of implementation of reform measures

Evaluating the results of implementing reform measures is critical to understanding their impact on labor equity and balance Engel et al., 2020) discuss the challenges of systematically implementing significant police reform, particularly in influencing individual officers' decision-making when potentially violent encounters occur (Engel et

al., 2020). Likewise, Tabatadze (2019) discusses comprehensive social policy reforms, including the pension system, to improve financial sustainability and the labor force participation of seniors (Tabatadze, 2019). Evaluating the results of these reforms can provide insight into their effectiveness in achieving desired outcomes.

B. Identify the obstacles and challenges faced

Identifying the obstacles and challenges faced during labor reform is critical to overcoming them and ensuring progress toward justice and balance (Tidmarsh, 2020; Tidmarsh, 2020; discusses the challenges of balancing client-centered service ideology with adherence to performance targets in probationary services (Tidmarsh, 2020). Understanding these barriers and challenges can inform strategies to overcome them and increase the effectiveness of labor reform efforts.

C. Opportunities for further improvement and development

Identifying opportunities for further improvement and development is critical to advancing labor reform and achieving greater fairness and balance (Dunatchik & Özcan, 2020) discusses the impact of paternity leave policies on the labor market and the potential for improving work-life balance and gender equality (Dunatchik & Özcan, 2020). They also highlight the positive impact of paternity leave policies on labor force engagement and subsequent childbearing (Dunatchik & Özcan, 2020). Additionally, Christl et al (2021) discuss the role of short-term work and discretionary policies in mitigating the impact of the COVID-19 crisis on the labor market (Christl et al., 2021). Identifying these opportunities can guide policymakers in implementing effective strategies and policies to improve employment fairness and balance.

It is important to evaluate the results of reform measures, identify the obstacles and challenges faced, and identify opportunities for improvement and further development are important steps in achieving employment justice and balance. The references provided provide insight into the impacts and challenges of various employment reforms, including police reform, pension system reform, emotional labor in the probation service, and paternity leave policies. These references can inform policymakers and researchers in their efforts to assess the effectiveness of labor reform measures, address challenges, and identify opportunities for improvement.

CONCLUSIONS

The articles presented in this research reveal various aspects related to labor reform in Indonesia. Topics studied include labor market evaluation (Bradley & Kügler, 2019), primary care doctor satisfaction (Maharani et al., 2019), determinants of worker poverty (Faharuddin & Endrawati, 2022), foreign direct investment (Suryanta & Patunru, 2022), youth unemployment (Yanindah, 2022), and the relationship between employment and married women's labor force participation (Rimkute & Sugiharti, 2022). These findings provide insight into the dynamics and challenges surrounding labor reform in Indonesia.

Implications: These findings have important implications for policymakers, researchers, and stakeholders involved in labor reform. Labor market evaluation (Bradley & Kügler, 2019) can provide direction in developing future policies and designing effective strategies

to promote fairness and balance in the labor market. Understanding the factors that influence primary care physicians' job satisfaction (Maharani et al., 2019) has the potential to improve working conditions and retention of medical personnel. The determinants of worker poverty (Faharuddin & Endrawati, 2022) and foreign direct investment (Suryanta & Patunru, 2022) provide important insights into the economic factors that influence the dynamics of employment and investment in Indonesia. Handling youth unemployment (Yanindah, 2022) requires targeted interventions and policies. The relationship between employment and labor force participation of married women (Rimkute & Sugiharti, 2022) highlights the importance of considering gender factors and the role of household technology in designing employment policies.

Follow-up: These findings require further action in several aspects. Ongoing evaluation of labor market reforms is necessary to understand their impact and effectiveness (Bradley & Kügler, 2019). Efforts to improve job satisfaction and working conditions for health workers must continue to be made (Maharani et al., 2019). Focusing on the determinants of worker poverty (Faharuddin & Endrawati, 2022) and attracting foreign direct investment (Suryanta & Patunru, 2022) is an important step for policymakers. Careful intervention development is needed to overcome youth unemployment (Yanindah, 2022). In addition, there needs to be policies that support gender equality and married women's labor force participation (Rimkute & Sugiharti, 2022).

REFERENCES

- Bargain, O., & Boutin, D. (2019). Minimum age regulation and child labor: New evidence from Brazil. *The World Bank Economic Review*, 35(1), 234-260. doi:10.1093/wber/lhz047
- Bradley, J., & Kügler, A. (2019). Labor market reforms: An evaluation of the Hartz policies in Germany. *European Economic Review*, 113, 108-135. doi:10.1016/j.euroecorev.2018.12.008
- Christl, M., Poli, S. D., Hufkens, T., Peichl, A., & Ricci, M. (2021). The role of short-time work and discretionary policy measures in mitigating the effects of the COVID-19 crisis in Germany. *SSRN Electronic Journal*. doi:10.2139/ssrn.3848334
- Dunatchik, A., & Özcan, B. (2020). Reducing Mommy penalties with Daddy quotas. *Journal of European Social Policy*, 31(2), 175-191. doi:10.1177/0958928720963324
- Engel, R. S., McManus, H. D., & Isaza, G. T. (2020). Moving beyond "Best practice": Experiences in police reform and a call for evidence to reduce officer-involved shootings. *The ANNALS of the American Academy of Political and Social Science*, 687(1), 146-165. doi:10.1177/0002716219889328
- Faharuddin, F., & Endrawati, D. (2022). Determinants of working poverty in Indonesia. *Journal of Economics and Development*, 24(3), 230-246. doi:10.1108/jed-09-2021-0151

- Firdausy, S., & Mahanani, A. E. (2021). Legal protection effort towards Mark owner from the share-in jar cosmetic trade. *SIGN Jurnal Hukum*, 3(1), 26-39. doi:10.37276/sjh.v3i1.113
- Study on the Calculation of the Gender Inequality Index 2022. (2022). Jakarta, Indonesia: BPS RI.
- Kazlou, A., & Klinthall, M. (2019). Entrepreneurial response to changing opportunity structures. *International Journal of Entrepreneurial Behavior & Research*, 25(5), 859-879. doi:10.1108/ijebr-02-2018-0090
- Kobayashi, Y., & Kondo, N. (2019). Organizational justice, psychological distress, and stress-related behaviors by occupational class in female Japanese employees. *PLOS ONE*, 14(4), e0214393. doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0214393
- König, S., Kelfve, S., Motel-Klingebiel, A., & Wetzel, M. (2021). Development of healthcare use across contemporary retirement pathways: Results from a register based cohort study. *Scandinavian Journal of Public Health*, 50(4), 440-447. doi:10.1177/1403494821998901
- Less law and reform, more politics and enforcement: A civil society approach to integrating rights and development. (2005). Retrieved from <https://academic.oup.com/book/4642/chapter/146807281>
- Lott, Y. (2019). Is maternal labor market re-entry after childbirth facilitated by mothers' and partners' flextime? *Human Relations*, 73(8), 1106-1128. doi:10.1177/0018726719856669
- Maharani, C., Afief, D. F., Weber, D., Marx, M., & Loukanova, S. (2019). Primary care physicians' satisfaction after health care reform: A cross-sectional study from two cities in Central Java, Indonesia. *BMC Health Services Research*, 19(1). doi:10.1186/s12913-019-4121-2
- The majority of Indonesia's unemployed will be young in August 2022. (2023, January 12). Retrieved from <https://databoks.katadata.co.id/datapublish/2023/01/12/mayoritas-pengunjuguran-indonesia-berusia-muda-pada-augustus-2022>
- Ndhlovu, P., & Ndhlovu, P. (2022). The dark side of section 63(3b) of the labour act (Chapter 28:01): The perspective of the stakeholders. *Conflict Resolution Quarterly*, 40(2), 187-197. doi:10.1002/crq.21357
- Petersson, E., Törnbohm, K., Hange, D., Nejati, S., Jerlock, M., Wikberg, C., ... Svenningsson, I. (2020). The experiences of care managers and rehabilitation coordinators of a primary care intervention to promote return to work for patients with common mental disorders: A qualitative study. *BMC Family Practice*, 21(1). doi:10.1186/s12875-020-01348-x
- Rimkute, A., & Sugiharti, L. (2022). The link between occupations, labor force participation of married women, and household technology in Indonesia. *Journal of Population and Social Studies*, 31, 20-37. doi:10.25133/jpssv312023.002
- Riphahn, R. T., & Schrader, R. (2019). Institutional reforms of 2006 and the dramatic rise in old-age employment in Germany. *ILR Review*, 73(5), 1185-1225. doi:10.1177/0019793919863378

- Roscigno, V. J. (2019). Discrimination, sexual harassment, and the impact of workplace power. *Socius: Sociological Research for a Dynamic World*, 5, 237802311985389. doi:10.1177/2378023119853894
- Satriawan, D., Pitoyo, A. J., & Giyarsih, S. R. (2020). Universal Health Coverage (UHC) for Informal Sector Workers in Indonesia. *TATALOKA*, 22(4), 556-572. doi:10.14710/tataloka.22.4.556-572
- Schein, A. I., Maghsoudi, N., Marshall, Z., Churchill, S., Ziegler, C., & Werb, D. (2020). Impact evaluations of drug decriminalisation and legal regulation on drug use, health and social harms: A systematic review. *BMJ Open*, 10(9), e035148. doi:10.1136/bmjopen-2019-035148
- Suryanta, B., & Patunru, A. A. (2022). Determinants of foreign direct investment in Indonesia. *Global Journal of Emerging Market Economies*, 15(1), 109-131. doi:10.1177/09749101211067856
- Tabatadze, M. (2019). Optimal structure of pension system and its influence on the social policy of state budget. *SSRN Electronic Journal*. doi:10.2139/ssrn.3433955
- Tidmarsh, M. (2020). 'The right kind of person for the job'? Emotional labour and organizational professionalism in probation. *International Journal of Law, Crime and Justice*, 61, 100363. doi:10.1016/j.ijlcj.2019.100363
- Triningsih, A. (n.d.). Employment Law: Policies and Protection of Workers in Foreign Investment / Anna Triningsih | Constitutional Court Library. Retrieved from <https://simpus.mkri.id/opac/detail-opac?id=10393>
- Ujang Charda S. (2014). Political Reform of Employment Law in Indonesian Government Policy. *Journal of Legal Insight*, Vol. 31 No. September 2, 2014, 31.
- Wang, M., Liu, G. G., Zhao, H., Butt, T., Yang, M., & Cui, Y. (2020). The role of mediation in solving medical disputes in China. *BMC Health Services Research*, 20(1). doi:10.1186/s12913-020-5044-7
- Yanindah, A. (2022). An insight into youth unemployment in Indonesia. *Proceedings of The International Conference on Data Science and Official Statistics*, 2021(1), 666-682. doi:10.34123/icdsos.v2021i1.229

WEBSITE

1 Out of 3 Indonesian Workers Receive Low Wages in 2020. (2021, July 11). Retrieved from <https://databoks.katadata.co.id/datapublish/2021/07/11/1-dari-3-pekerja-indonesia-menerima-upah-dasar-pada-2020>

Retrieved from <http://eprints2.ipdn.ac.id/id/eprint/862/1/10088-Article%20Text-35148-1-10-20220719.pdf>

Retrieved from https://jdih.kemnaker.go.id/asset/data_artikel/info_hukum_1_2.pdf

Retrieved from
<https://pauddikmasjateng.kemdikbud.go.id/perpus/index.php?bid=1850&fid=21&p=fstream-pdf>

Retrieved from <https://uk.practicallaw.thomsonreuters.com/w-010-7310?contextData=%28sc.Default%29&transitionType=Default>

Retrieved from <https://www.ilo.org/dyn/travail/docs/760/Indonesian+Undang-Undang+Ketenagakerjaan++Undang-Undang+Nomor+13+Tahun+2003.pdf>

Retrieved from https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---asia/---ro-bangkok/---ilo-jakarta/documents/publication/wcms_157809.pdf

Agustinus Beo Da Costa, Maikel Jefriando. (2020, January 20). Indonesia unions hold protests over planned labour reform. Retrieved from <https://www.reuters.com/article/indonesia-protests-idINKBN1ZJ0PM>

Indonesia: Labour law reform aims at pleasing investors at the expenses of workers' rights. (2020, October 3). Retrieved from <https://www.ituc-csi.org/Indonesia-omnibus-law-threatens-decent-work>

Jdih.kemnaker.go.id. (2014, September 25). So Ministry of Manpower. Retrieved from <https://jdih.kemnaker.go.id/berita-kebijakan-ketenagakerjaan.html>

Who owns the economy? Property rights, privatization, and the Indonesian constitution: The electricity law case. (2010). Retrieved from <https://academic.oup.com/book/9143/chapter/155757803>